

**Summary Minutes**  
**City of Sedona**  
**Historic Preservation Commission Meeting**  
**Vultee Conference Room, 102 Roadrunner Drive, Building 106, Sedona, Arizona**  
**Monday, October 10, 2016 – 4:00 p.m.**

**1. Call to order, Pledge of Allegiance, roll call**

Chair Unger called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m., led the Pledge of Allegiance and requested roll call.

**Roll Call:**

**Commissioners Present:** Chair Brynn Burkee Unger, Vice Chair Ann Jarmusch and Commissioners Harry Danilevics, Jane Grams, Allyson Holmes and Steve Segner. Kurt Gehlbach was absent.

**Staff Members Present:** Warren Campbell, Cynthia Lovely and Donna Puckett

**2. Commission and Staff announcements**

Warren Campbell announced that this might be Commissioner Grams last meeting, and the Commissioner agreed, because she will not be available the first part of November. Chair Unger noted that the Commission doesn't know if there will be a November meeting yet, so it also might be Commissioner Danilevics's last meeting as well.

Chair Unger indicated that the interviews for the HPC vacancies are scheduled and Vice Chair Jarmusch will be doing the interviews, since she (the Chair) is one of the candidates.

**3. Approval of the July 11, 2016 and September 19, 2016 minutes**

Donna Puckett indicated that regarding the approval of minutes, as the Commissioners probably know, there have been various interpretations of the statues over the years regarding the approval of minutes, and the latest interpretation that we have received is that you do not need to be concerned about which Commissioners attended which meetings, because you act as a collective body, not as individuals. Additionally, the agendas themselves confirm the meetings were properly noticed, because they contain the date of the posting and by whom.

Chair Unger noted that one of the problems had been in having a different number of Commissioners present than those that attended the previous meeting and we weren't able to approve them, so from now on we can do that; however, Donna added, as long as a quorum is present to vote.

Warren noted that the approval is for both July 11<sup>th</sup> and September 19<sup>th</sup>, and Chair Unger then asked if both could be included in one motion and Donna stated, yes.

**MOTION:** *Commissioner Danilevics moved to approve the minutes of July 11, 2016 and September 19, 2016. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grams. VOTE: Motion carried five (5) for, zero (0) opposed and one (1) abstention. Vice Chair Jarmusch abstained, because she did not attend one of the meetings and Commissioner Gehlbach was absent.*

**4. PUBLIC FORUM:** *(This is the time for the public to comment on matters not listed on the agenda. The Commission may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H), action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date.)*

*Chair Unger opened the public forum and, having no requests to speak on items not on the agenda, closed the public forum.*

**5. Presentation and discussion of the Ranger Station Park Master Plan and Estimate of Probable Cost.**

**Presentation, Cynthia Lovely:** Cynthia stated that as an update, we are going out to bid this week for the hazard mitigation, because the big green administrative building has asbestos and lead, and there is more scattered around the property, so before we can demo some of that, we need to get the hazard mitigation done, and that should be finished in the next month or two. If you see people in white hazmat suits, that is what that is all about. Then, we can start the demo of the green administration building, the two small sheds and the one shed near the house with a carport. She is not sure how long the hazard mitigation will take, but the demo may start this winter.

Cynthia indicated that the consultant, Norris Designs, is doing the Master Plan and this site plan is just one piece of what they are working on now. The goal is to have everything ready for the City Council on November 10<sup>th</sup>, and the Master Plan as well as the Estimate of Probable Cost and schematic designs will be presented to the Council at that time. Chair Unger requested that the Commission be reminded of that date, so Commissioners can be present.

Cynthia stated that the other thing being done this week is a similar presentation to the Planning & Zoning Commission on Thursday to get their perspective, and we are here for the historic preservation perspective. Cynthia noted that she is not going to go through the history and property description, because you know it already, but she would remind the Commission that the consultant, Norris Designs, has been given the conceptual proposal from maybe a year ago and that is what they were working from. We do have an estimate of probable cost and we asked them to break it up into a base cost, which would be before pickleball, a community garden, etc., and the low estimate is \$787,000 with a high estimate is \$1.4 million. Those are ballpark figures, but we had at one point a budget of \$700,000, plus we have to keep in mind that this does not account for the building restoration. There were some estimates that are probably out of date, but the building restoration ran around \$300,000, although there was a huge range, and for the Master Plan estimates with pickleball and the garden, it could be as high as \$1.7 million for everything, except the buildings, and on the low end, it was \$961,000.

Cynthia explained that we don't know exactly what our balance is, because the hazard mitigation, demolition and design consultant will all be paid out of the same pot essentially. Chair Unger noted that there are some issues with the roof and some structural issues with the buildings. She then asked if those are going to be addressed before they start with the project on the grounds. From the Commission's standpoint, she would like to see them ensure that we don't have further structural damage over time. When we went there as a Commission the last time, there was concern about the roof and areas that haven't been painted, so the Commission would like to have it noted that before dedicating a large amount of money to the property around the buildings, we want to ensure that the buildings remain safe and not become something that we have to knock down, because they deteriorated too much. Commissioner Segner and Commissioner Grams agreed that absolutely the buildings should be a top priority – that is what it is all about.

Cynthia indicated that in discussions with Audree, the Building Condition Assessment Report that we were going with was from 2006, and we felt that once we get the hazard mitigation and demolition done, we may hire that same consultant to do an update, and part of that includes looking at the basic maintenance repairs, which might happen next spring. There also was a 2014 Structural Condition Assessment Report that we could refer to. Commissioner Segner asked if we really need to pay a consultant to go back over a written report, and Cynthia explained that on the structural condition report, no, and that might be what we work from as far as maintenance and repairs, but for the other that talks about rehabilitation for \$300,000, we would. Commissioner Segner agreed, but added that we don't need to pay someone to tell us if it is up to snuff; we or the

City can do a walk through. Chair Unger added that we will probably need an updated number on how much it will cost, although the same things are probably wrong with it and maybe more.

Cynthia Lovely noted that everyone should have a copy of the historic photos, and on the back side of the bottom one, it says Ranger Station in 1950's. This photo was newly found and is significant, because it shows the barn. A lot of the historic photos were taken before the barn or at an angle that doesn't include the barn, and this was also before the green administration building was built. If the green building was built in 1953, then this photo was clearly before that. When you look at the Master Plan, this historic photo helps to remind us of how the property was used historically, particularly the barn. It was a working barn with gravel or dirt around it and cars and working trucks parked right up to the barn.

Cynthia Lovely indicated that in front of the barn, we still have the idea of a plaza, and we are proposing decomposed granite, which is nicer than gravel and consistent with the historic use of the area. We added more pathways than what are there currently, because of ADA access. There is an existing one that leads directly to the house and the new one is for ADA accessibility, so if you are at the barn, you can take the pathway to the right and get to the existing ramp to the house. ADA accessibility is a challenge with certain features, because we are getting rid of the current ADA parking, since we frown on parking that has to back out onto the street, so that parking has been moved to the south side of the barn.

Cynthia stated that we are proposing some concrete from the parking around the west side of the barn and extending that around the front, because if you remember the open house we had in the winter, it was snowing and dripping and the water tended to puddle on the north side of the barn, so this would help with drainage on that north side. We tried to not do too much around the buildings, especially from the road, to maintain that historic context if you are driving down Brewer. We didn't put anything on the west side, so when driving by, you would see the barn and the house hopefully pretty much as it has always looked. At one point the consultant had mentioned that we could put in a wall and trees with landscaping, but we told them to take it out, so we could maintain that open view of the buildings. Cynthia explained that the retaining wall is historic and probably built around the same time, so we want to retain that one on the north side of the plaza, and it would get restored or left as is if it is in good shape.

Cynthia pointed out that there is an option A and B, and they are not either/or. We just want to show what it could look like with a community garden and without, plus a couple of different designs on pickleball, so that when it goes to the City Council, they are going to be given a menu of options, and they will have the base cost, see the cost of pickleball and the garden, and that is when the Council will get into discussions about what features should stay or go and their priorities or where they might phase things. As you know from the cost, the minimum base cost is \$787,000 at this point, which is higher than what we have now, so that will be an issue. Commissioner Holmes added that is without the building restoration.

Cynthia explained that the Commission doesn't need to get into whether or not there are going to be certain features. We are asking the Commission about the layout and how this impacts or affects the historic context, and if there are recommendations on changes.

#### **Commission's Questions and Comments:**

Commissioner Segner stated that it is a historic park and when you do an architectural rendering, it tends to look very modern. They have a tendency to make things modern as they do them, so we need to roughen up the edges and keep in mind that if there is going to be hardscape, it needs to be in the character of the hardscape of the time. If a wall has to be put in, it should be done the way they did it in the 20's and 30's, using the old ways, and that goes without saying. The community garden is absolutely a must, but he doesn't think much money needs to be put into it; we need two spaces. He ran a community garden here for five years and likes the idea of two spaces – one should be organic and then the other space, keeping them a little far apart, so somebody spraying plants isn't going to spray other people's plants. If you take an area and fence

it with 1920 rabbit fencing and a nice little gate, you don't need a barn. For most of the public gardens he ran, a barn wasn't needed, because most of the time you are using a shovel and taking trash out. They used large lockers that electricians might put tools in and locked it. Also, the community garden should be roughed out, but be built by the community. That is a good area to raise money and do some things, and by bringing in the community to build it, we will get the community to use it.

Commissioner Segner then indicated that as far as planting around the edges, no decorative plants and trees; either a natural tree or fruit tree. In those days, they would have used pomegranates, mulberries and catalpa trees that have a natural feel to them. We are not going to get into the maples and pretty trees. When in doubt, plant as opposed to build hardscape; if you have a wall choice, let a hedge grow. As far as the trees, the City shouldn't buy any tree. We can raise enough money and get people to donate trees and shrubs to make it a community involvement. He can raise all of the catalpa's you want in one year, but by getting people to donate, we can get some of the things we want and save money.

Commissioner Segner stated that as far as pickleball, it doesn't go with the area and it doesn't fit. From one to five, if we had the money, it wouldn't be a five, but it certainly is not a one. The paths should look more organic and rough on the edges – not poured concrete that is perfect with maintained edges. It should be rough and look like an old kept 1920 park. When he built his building, it was really hard to get that across to people. Cynthia Lovely clarified that the only concrete walkways would be the ADA accessibility and into the buildings. The perimeter path and most of the internal would be gravel.

Chair Unger noted that this has come to the Commission on a historic level, and all of us would agree with Commissioner Segner's comments on the trees, etc. We want it to look like it did when the buildings were built, and that lawn looks really green, but the reality is that they did have lawns outside of their houses, so that really isn't out of context. The community garden is a much better use of space given what we are trying to do historically. There were orchards in the area, but she doesn't think there were orchards with that barn, so she would prefer that it be a community garden; however, Commissioner Holmes clarified that east of the barn, there were orchard trees.

The Chair then stated that we want it to feel like all of the components belonged in that time, and she knows the Commission has been adamant about the pickleball courts. It is probably something we won't get our way with, but it is good that it is far away from the barn, although it still is something that historically shouldn't be part of it in her opinion. Commissioner Segner added that is a political decision.

Commissioner Danilevics stated that looking at the design of other buildings in town, the designing of things with barbed wire and rocks isn't custom to the past, and looking at this, he hopes they didn't do that along here as well, following the current trends of wrapping rocks with barbed wire and other things of that nature; that is not historic – the gabion walls. He also doesn't know what the trees are that are pink, but they don't look local or historic. They look more like they are trying to be a park that you would see in Phoenix. The walkways look perfectly landscaped and that could also be like don't plan the walkways as much. Another thing is that the tables are segregated into two areas, so that is basically going to force people to choose the corner or behind the barn for picnic tables, but maybe they should have picnic tables near the parking lot, the corner of the pickleball, the trees near Los Abrigados, the corner near Los Abridagos and the corner near El Portal. The picnic tables should be spread out, usually people don't like to sit next to other people and if you force people to picnic right next to each other, the park is going to be of limited use versus having those tables spread out 50 meters each way, you would probably have those tables used all the time.

Cynthia Lovely explained that it is hard to see the picnic tables on here, but they are scattered. The problem is that they are sometimes under a tree, but given this comment, we will have him make

the tables stand out more and spread them out even more. Commissioner Holmes asked if there is a picnic table count, because that would help.

Commissioner Segner then suggested not going to the current modern picnic tables that are poured concrete and go to little old-style movable tables, so you could get together and move them, instead of those heavy ones when they are worried about stealing. Commissioner Danilevics mentioned the ability to stage them in the hotter climate, and Chair Unger indicated they would feel more like the old-fashioned ones rather than the cement ones. Commissioner Segner added that if they have a big event, it would be nice to grab 10 benches and put them in a row, so maybe not being so anal that everything is totally defined, so things can be moved. There might be an area to store them if we have extras; there could be a little shed and we could put 100 lawn chairs in there, and if someone comes, you bring out the lawn chairs. Keep it casual.

Commissioner Grams agreed with much of what Commissioner Segner said and she has problems with the pickleball. She knows it will come up, although she doesn't know if it will be with this City Council or the new one, but political or whatever, it doesn't belong in this park. If she was Los Abridados, she would be out with a petition against this, and she was tempted to take this to them and suggest that today; she feels so strongly about it. It is wrong. She drove down there today to look at it. The Commissioner then pointed out the heart of the property and the pretty part, and indicated that a lot of it has been taken up with parking. She then identified the ugly part of the property and indicated that it is a traffic nightmare; you have a big road and all of the traffic -- it is zip, zip, zip. Today, there was a big 18-wheeler oil truck parked in front of the school headquarters, and he was waiting or whatever. Traffic was going and coming, but we are losing in many ways, the main heart of the property. It has some natural trees that should be preserved, and there are about 60 or 70 trees that should be taken away. We're not going to put 60 or 70 trees in there. It is distracting from what you are looking at, so it should be brought back to a more natural form like everybody is saying. This is like a uniform, landscaped area. Cynthia Lovely asked if the Commissioner is saying that it is showing too many trees, and the Commissioner stated yes, you couldn't possibly put that many. They should be natural trees; there are many trees there, but you don't want it to be patterned like a golf course. You want them scattered among the lawn, where kids would play and people would picnic under them.

Chair Unger agreed it looked like a golf course with the big green spot there, but what exactly is that to be used for? Cynthia explained that area is intentionally open and we are modeling it after Sunset Park, which is an extremely popular open grassy lawn. Commissioner Grams stated that she agrees with that completely, and there are some trees scattered there now that should be saved. The Chair indicated that the plan now would be to remove those trees and make that a big green space without the trees. Commissioner Grams commented that there aren't that many of them, probably only about five.

Cynthia Lovely stated that very few of them are natural; the native areas that he has been asked to leave alone on the plan is the very north triangle where there is native vegetation that will remain untouched, and there are a couple of trees on the northwest corner that we are going to try to salvage. We did a tree inventory including the type of trees and a lot of them are weed trees, which we have started removing, because it can take two to three years to get control of some of the Tree of Heaven, so there are not that many trees today. Commissioner Segner added that part of it is having a few specimen trees in good sized boxes. Trees that are going to grow and be good-looking trees to give you the depth with some big, medium and small trees, so it doesn't grow like grass at the same speed -- a good sycamore tree or catalpa tree that has a 3-base on it will be decent looking in five years, and we can get a lot of that donated, but less trees and specimen trees. They don't show many bushes, but we can put in lavender and let them grow wild. Historically, they would have had irises along the edge. He has thousands that he just planted and they take off, but they are a great border, so that is the kind of stuff that he would go for.

Commissioner Grams referenced the corner where the pickleball court is and indicated that it has a big swale, a deep ditch and a big mound that would be a natural area to create a mound for

children instead of trying to level it or put culverts through it. They could have a little tree house there, a slide and swings; it would be a natural play thing. Commissioner Segner stated that is a great idea to have a natural dirt area to play and dig in; there is nothing wrong with that. Commissioner Grams added that it would save a lot of money in getting this place cleaned out, because it is a nightmare with a jungle of bushes. She couldn't get in to really tell, but she also measured parking spaces at Walgreen's and she came up with around 44 to 50 spaces that she could easily see. She then pointed out where many of hers were located, because it is the most accessible, and originally all of the parking was down in the corner where the pickleball is now, but she hopes they will go away. Where she would put them, there could be about eight cars in a pull-off. She knows you want a pathway for the community and you could have that, but there is room for some parking. It is just not a desirable area for picnics on that busy corner. The view down there is into a parking lot that is rather unsightly, so there needs to be a nice wall or a lot of shrubbery added to give privacy. It needs to be thought through as to what there is naturally and what will look more natural and less like a formal . . . Cynthia Lovely interjected that one of the concerns with the parking and driveways, similar to why we will no longer have that ADA parking, is safety. We don't want driveways around that curve, because of the sightlines, so that is one of the reasons that we don't have parking and driveways further to the north.

Commissioner Segner referenced the proposed location of the community garden and stated that if you could do a pull-in and pull-out and park along the edge, but you also will need trash pick-up near the garden. People don't want to park way down there, and then walk up to the garden, so if you could put even four or five spaces. He found that there was only three or four people at his garden at any given time, but by having a few spaces, a pull-through or parallel parking, you don't need a lot of space.

Commissioner Grams asked who will maintain the community garden and Commissioner Segner stated that we will have to form groups. Commissioner Grams then asked if they have been real successful in the past, and Commissioner Segner stated that he did a two-acre garden on Schnebly and they had a great time. You have the plant Nazis, but that is okay. He just learned that everyone has to have their space and be able to do their thing. He thinks a lot of people will want to do it. Commissioner Grams asked about the javelinas and rabbits, and Commissioner Segner stated that he would recommend rabbit fencing, and just use old piping and make it high enough that animals don't get in. He has seen where they use chain-link fencing on a 45° angle along the edging to grow vines and all of the fruit hangs down. All we really have to do is pour concrete edges and have water plumbed to it with a timer or a sprinkler or you can flood, and a little power for a few lights. There are all kinds of information on how to do that and it is not particularly expensive. We could pour all of the boxes on one Saturday, if we all built frames, and we can get people to chip in on it.

Chair Unger indicated that she thinks Commissioner Grams is mostly concerned with maintaining the historic look, and Commissioner Grams stated, absolutely. The Chair then noted that Commissioner Holmes lived there in the 50's and asked her what it was like on that part of the property. Commissioner Holmes stated that it was pretty rugged and you wouldn't want it the way it was. She pointed out an area that was all foxtails that would be burned off; it is not going to be the way it was; however, she has to register her dislike of the pickleball courts, but she understands that we are making a park for the community and a certain part of the community has expressed strongly that they want it and will use it, so it is a community park.

Commissioner Grams asked why it couldn't go to Posse Grounds and Commissioner Holmes indicated that she didn't understand that either. Commissioner Grams then stated that it doesn't belong in that neighborhood with the homes along there. You are going to need lights and originally we said there would be no lights. Commissioner Segner commented that we just want the dark sky. Chair Unger then asked if there are going to be lights and Cynthia responded that we haven't gotten to that level of detailed design.

Commissioner Segner stated that what bothers him is that the pickleball is way over there, so we have to run power over there, so he looks at it as we only have so much money, so where are we going to put the money? Cynthia Lovely again explained that this meeting is not to decide that; Council will address that.

Chair Unger agreed and stated that any objection that the Commission raises has to be on the basis of the historic perspective, and Commissioner Grams added that it is not historic. Commissioner Holmes then asked if we make a court or two, can the surface be used for other things. For example, she doesn't see where the food truck might go, so maybe a space or two next to the court where a food truck could pull-in to use that as a food court-type setting instead of just solely dedicated to pickleball. The open lawn will be used; people will turn their kids lose there. Chair Unger added that the lawn is not countering anything that was on the property before, that open green space is not . . . Commissioner Holmes interjected that was the parking lot for the garbage trucks and a weed field, and she is shocked that you haven't found toxic waste next to Steve's place, but she is really glad. Historically, it wasn't that pretty, but the views were stunning and we still have those, so she is just thrilled that this is happening.

Vice Chair Jarmusch indicated that her fellow Commissioners have done an excellent job and she doesn't have much to add, except that pickleball courts are not historic and aside from the two buildings, they are the only rectilinear part of the plan. Everything else is organic, and she agreed with Commissioners Segner, Grams and Holmes that the curves should be even rougher – kind of like you are discovering part of this property as you wander through it. Commissioner Grams added that it is too organized and Commissioner Segner agreed. Vice Chair Jarmusch then asked if the consultants had walked the property and Cynthia Lovely stated yes, and this is probably the 5<sup>th</sup> iteration. There are all sorts of things we had them change; an example was at one point he had 78 parking spaces.

Commissioner Segner asked when it goes to P&Z or the City Council, is there any way you can take some pictures of samples of what we are talking about like fencing, walls, etc., because they won't get it if we say old, but if they see an old fence that is rusted out or the kind of wall we are looking for, and we can get those kind of pictures. Cynthia explained that the consultant is preparing some photo boards with examples of things like picnic tables, swings, etc.

Chair Unger asked if that is not something the HPC should see too, and Cynthia Lovely explained that they are not ready yet and it will be the same with P&Z on Thursday. The Chair stated that she wants to be sure that this Commission has a chance to look at those things too. She thought maybe it would be ready for P&Z. Cynthia stated that as the Historic Preservation Commission, when we start construction, we will have to get a Certificate of Appropriateness, so all of the details will come back to the Commission, but at this point, we don't have those details.

Commissioner Segner asked what P&Z's responsibility is, aren't they supposed to see that it is in keeping with the zoning? Cynthia Lovely stated that it is, and we are presenting it probably more as a courtesy. Commissioner Segner then commented good, because he didn't want them to see this and all of a sudden, they become park experts.

Vice Chair Jarmusch asked about the "demonstration" garden that is drought tolerant, and Cynthia stated that it is supposed to have native plants. The Vice Chair then asked if it would be a historic demonstration garden, because it would be in keeping with . . . Cynthia Lovely interjected that is where we may need to do some research as to what that entails. Vice Chair Jarmusch stated if that is the case, perhaps it could be moved closer to the historic buildings. Commissioner Holmes stated apricot trees and iris; there is a gorgeous tree still there.

Commissioner Grams again indicated that she feels strongly about all of this parking taking the beautiful area; some of it could go up there, because no one is going to sit at a picnic table there. There is a lot of traffic going through and they can design an area for parking there to allow more of the other area to be natural. They are taking almost all of the frontage; between pickleball and

parking, there is nothing else. Cynthia Lovely explained that the parking was intentionally placed there. In earlier designs, the parking was in a different location and the reason for the parking the way it is now is to provide a buffer between the road, so if you are in the lawn area, you have the parking between, as opposed to an earlier version, when the lawn was along Brewer Road and the concern was the noise and traffic from the roadway would have been too close.

Commissioner Segner pointed out a rocky area and indicated that every area is going to have to be maintained, watered and planted; however, Cynthia explained that the northern triangle from about the orchard of trees are all native and will be left as is. The Commissioner then asked about moving the garden over, because Commissioner Grams is right, that is not going to be used. Cynthia stated that they were trying to keep that open from the road for the historic views.

Warren Campbell asked if they are suggesting shifting the garden and putting some parking spaces where the garden is shown; if so, we could look at that. Commissioner Segner pointed out a location for the parking with a pull-in, pull-out and a trash container. It would be pretty from the street with a nice little 4 ft. fence and a nice garden. Cynthia explained that she doesn't think Engineering will allow a driveway at that north end, because of the sightlines. Commissioner Holmes added that it also is very steep and there is a curve too. Chair Unger agreed that she didn't think that would be an option.

Chair Unger noted that the Commission needed to go back to what we wanted in the past; we wanted to be sure that the view of the buildings would be clear. If we had put an orchard there, it would have been a problem, but she doesn't see the garden as a problem. You may want to expand the size of the garden into that area; that wouldn't be a problem. Commissioner Holmes asked why an orchard would be a problem and a garden wouldn't, and Chair Unger explained that the trees would block views. We want to be able to see the buildings from the street and an orchard would not give you that viewpoint.

Commissioner Segner asked what if the park became kind of a public garden and really got bigger and almost wrapped around the building. Cynthia Lovely explained that we intentionally asked the designer to not place anything too close to the buildings, because we want to maintain the historic context around the buildings. Chair Unger recalled that is actually something the Commission has talked about; they were following our guidance on that for sure. Commissioner Segner then stated that he just returned from Greece and took 20 pictures of trellises. When they need shade they use plants and we can do those things here that would be interesting like where all of these trees are lined up, you could do a trellis and it could be grapes like at his hotel. He is now trying to grow a grape trellis over the walking bridge on S.R. 179. We could put up wires and grow grapes over the top of that to make people want to walk through it. Chair Unger added that they did that in Bisbee too. The Commissioner then indicated that having an organic group, and then another and another makes you go see it. Otherwise, it is just a big lawn, but if there is something interesting going on like growing berries, people will walk to the berries, so we could get people moving through the park by doing nice organic features. The old-timers took old bedsprings and planted them in the ground and that became their hedge and they would plant their berries in the hedges and they all filled in, and there has to be this new and old vibe that people say they can do in their backyard. Chair Unger added that it also gives the context of the history, and we wanted the City to buy the buildings to keep the history of them.

Vice Chair Jarmusch asked Commissioner Segner how much concrete he is talking about for the community garden, and Commissioner Segner indicated that you could do the planting areas with wood, but in Orange County, they pour 12-inch wide concrete in squares and fill in all of the organic material in them and you walk between the pieces. They have holes in them, so you can put up poles with shade structures, etc., and at the end are your faucets. When you lay it out, it is cool with this little dirt path, but everything is raised a little and that is your garden. It is just the square edge as opposed to digging into the ground and having it low, which you could do or you would build them up with wood, but if you form the concrete rough on the outside, it looks organic. He has seen them in test gardens in Orange County and Pasadena. Commissioner Grams asked if they could



be done with red rock in the concrete, and Commissioner Segner replied that you could do it like Frank Lloyd Wright where you push the rock in and pump-in the concrete and see the sides all rough. If we do it right, people will say it has been there a long time; we can make the concrete look old by facing it with red rock. It is that little extra detail that doesn't cost money, but architects aren't into that.

Commissioner Danilevics stated that pickleball is not historic and asked if the nets could be taken down if we make it multi-use. If it won't have lights, then in the evening, people could use the court to bring a picnic table or their own thing and use the concrete slap, which is one of the more expensive features that he sees, and we're already over-budget based on the estimate, so he doesn't know why a feature that's gone over budget, when we're in fiscal tough times as a City, is being included for political reasons. It makes sense to lower the budget of what we are spending . . . Chair Unger interjected that some of the court surfaces, for example a tennis court, you could never do that, but she doesn't know about a pickleball court. On a basketball court, you have to wear tennis shoes, but it is worth a question. Commissioner Danilevics then continued to say that if the maximum amount of people who can use the court is 100 in a community of 10,000, because that is the pickleballers entire listserv that they gave Council. Commissioner Segner noted that they can use the courts at Los Abrigados.

Cynthia Lovely again reminded the Commission that we are not here to debate it, and the Chair agreed, and then stated that the Commission's stand is that we don't want it, and you know it. Commissioner Segner then indicated that Commissioner Grams had a good point; it should be a dirt area with old tractor tires laying there – an organic play area.

*Chair Unger opened the public comment period at this time.*

**Stephen Arthur Young, Sedona, AZ:** Mr. Young indicated that he was glad to hear the support for the garden on this site and not support for the pickleball court; he never heard of this game. He loved the idea of expanding the garden in every place it can be without impeding the view and perhaps taking at least one-third of the huge grassy area to use for gardening. Even if it is just around the edging, the whole edge of it could be mostly garden. Reducing the parking would be awesome, but you have already gone over that. Thank you and keep putting your support through for the garden and help get it through the Council as well. He has at least 80 community members that are for this garden that he knows personally, and he has been to gatherings with them; they are ready to come out and build this thing.

**Alison Melton, Sedona, AZ:** Ms. Melton stated that she really liked the idea of a community garden, and thank you for lining that up. She has a comment, but tell her if her comment is wrong. She thought she heard you say that it will be a park with pesticides.

Commissioner Segner stated that there are some people that actually use pesticides . . . Chair Unger then interrupted to explain that she can make comments on what she thinks, but we can't react to the comments, because it is not part of what we can do now and we are not at the point that any decisions are going to be made.

**Alison Melton, Sedona, AZ (continued):** Ms. Melton explained that she studied permaculture design and there are many ways to go about gardening without pesticides. Pesticides and tilling may dry-up the soil, and she doesn't want to see this beautiful place turn into a dry desert area. She wants to see it lush and as edible as possible, so if we can stay away from pesticides, that is her only comment, and she feels like a lot of people in Sedona, being as holistic as they are, will agree with that. Thank you so much for setting it up, she is really excited.

*The Chair thanked the speakers for coming and encouraged them to come back when the Commission has this item again, and then having no additional requests to speak, the Chair closed the public comment period.*

Chair Unger asked staff if it is necessary for the HP Commissioners to attend the P&Z meeting and Cynthia Lovely indicated no. The Chair then asked about attending the City Council meeting and Warren explained that he didn't think the Council would be expecting you to speak, but if you wanted to be there for support for the comments, you all probably don't need to be there, because your comments on record will be passed along. Chair Unger then asked if they would be making the final decision and Cynthia indicated that they could.

Commissioner Segner asked if that would be for the design or the budget and Cynthia indicated the design. The Commissioner then stated that the Commissioners should be there and speak before the meeting if there are key things we should talk about. When he talked with the City Manager, he was not for the garden, because he thought they would probably be hard to maintain and people would lose interest, but he assured the City Manager that people won't lose interest. There will be plenty of interest in town, but we have to show them that the City is not going to get involved in the maintenance and trying to keep everybody happy. Some public group needs to say they are here and willing to help build it and do that, so a turnout on the community garden would be good.

Chair Unger agreed about the 10<sup>th</sup>, because this has been something that we have been so strongly supportive of and might want to be a part of, and then having no other comments, the Chair closed agenda item 5.

## **2. Commission and Staff announcements (continued)**

Warren asked to go back to announcements and stated that staff went to P&Z with Article 15 last week and one member of the Commission had a number of questions, and he is working through answering those, so we are going back on November 1<sup>st</sup> hoping they will make their recommendation, and we are currently scheduled to go to Council on December 14<sup>th</sup>. Commissioner Holmes stated that the process is agonizing long.

Chair Unger indicated that she had gotten some emails from people asking if they should attend, because they had gotten word that it is Article 15; not from not landmark owners, but a few people that had been on the Commission before, and her feeling was it is pretty straightforward, and she didn't see that P&Z would do much to alter where we are, but would it be wise for the Commission to be present. Warren Campbell indicated that he would hate to tell them no and later think they did, but he personally doesn't think it is necessary; however, it is an open public meeting and he would note that a letter was sent to all landmark owners to let them know the date we are going to P&Z and that we tentatively will be going to Council in December. It is what we promised we would do at the open house. Commissioner Segner commented that there is nothing to be against really.

Warren Campbell explained that he tried to explain that we are trying to make their lives a little bit more straightforward. The Chair suggested that maybe a couple of Commissioners be there; she has told everybody that she is really comfortable with it and that the Commission is really comfortable with it. Otherwise, we wouldn't have passed it; she doesn't see that there is really any issue, but she will check the date to see if that is possible for her and maybe we should all just put those dates on our calendars and be there if you think it might be important. It is November 1<sup>st</sup> for the P&Z on Article 15 and November 10<sup>th</sup> for the Master Plan. Commissioner Holmes asked what time the Council meetings start and Warren indicated that he thinks the work sessions are 3:30 p.m. Chair Unger then asked that staff send out an update on those dates.

## **6. Discussion regarding future meeting dates and future agenda items [Bring your Calendars]**

- **November 14, 2016**
- **December 12, 2016**
- **January 9, 2017**

Chair Unger noted that we have November 14<sup>th</sup>, December 12<sup>th</sup> and January 9<sup>th</sup> for the next three meetings. She then asked if anything had come up from the City for those dates, and Warren

indicated no. The Chair then indicated that we usually select the Chair for the next year in December, but she doesn't know if that is necessary on that date. Warren indicated that all of that could happen in January. Chair Unger then asked about the work plan and Warren stated we also would work on that in January.

The Chair indicated that the Commission had discussed doing a different kind of recognition program in the past, which was supposed to go on this year's agenda, but that goes until July of next year, and we still have time to do that, so she doesn't see that there is a necessity, although there is a possibility that if something comes up, we will have to come in, so she suggested that the Commissioners leave the dates on their calendars, just to leave them open.

Commissioner Danilevics stated that if there is not another meeting, this is his last month as Commissioner on the HPC and he would like to thank everybody who has been part of the meetings he has attended. Part of his inspiration to become a Commissioner was the Ranger Station Park and its role as a landmarked property, so participating in that has been a great joy and he is grateful for it. Thank you very much.

Chair Unger then thanked Commissioner Danilevics and Commissioner Grams for all of their help. Commissioner Grams has been here a lot longer and the energy she has put in over the six years has been wonderful, so she wanted to extend the Commission's thanks. Commissioner Grams stated that it has been her pleasure; she learned a lot and hopes she made a little bit of contribution here and there. She will always be willing to help on open houses if you get back into that, then historic tours and things like that. She is going to be traveling a lot, so she would rather not be committed to it. Chair Unger indicated that the Commission will be in touch if something comes up.

The Chair indicated that the next meeting will be set for January 9<sup>th</sup>.

## 7. **Adjournment**

Chair Unger requested a motion to adjourn.

***MOTION: Commissioner Danilevics so moved. Commissioner Segner seconded the motion.***

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 5:17 p.m. without objection.

I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission held on October 10, 2016.

---

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Administrative Assistant*

---

Date