

Summary Minutes
City of Sedona
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting
Vultee Conference Room, 102 Roadrunner Drive, Building 106, Sedona, Arizona
Monday, March 12, 2018 – 4:00 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, & ROLL CALL

Chair Unger called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m., led the Pledge of Allegiance and requested roll call.

Roll Call: Chair Brynn Burkee Unger and Commissioners James Curry, Kurt Gehlbach – arrived at 4:11 p.m., Jack Fiene, Allyson Holmes and Steve Segner. Commissioner Pfaff was unexcused.

Staff Members Present: Warren Campbell and Donna Puckett

Chair Unger asked to go to agenda item 3 to introduce the new Commissioner without objection.

3. ANNOUNCEMENTS & SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS BY COMMISSIONERS & STAFF

Chair Unger asked James Curry to introduce himself, and James indicated that he and his wife moved from Fort Lauderdale, Florida and have been in Sedona for two years. He retired as a real estate developer of historic properties in Florida and prior to that worked in advertising. The Commissioners then briefly introduced themselves to James.

Warren suggested going to agenda items 4-7 to see if other members arrive; there was no objection.

4. APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING MINUTES:

a. January 8, 2018 (R)

MOTION: Commissioner Holmes moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Segner seconded the motion. **VOTE:** Motion carried five (5) for and zero (0) opposed. (Commissioner Gehlbach was not present for the vote and Commissioner Pfaff was unexcused.)

5. PUBLIC FORUM: (This is the time for the public to comment on matters not listed on the agenda. The Commission may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H), action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date.)

Chair Unger opened the public forum and, having no requests to speak, closed the public forum.

6. Update/discussion regarding Certificate of No Effect approvals

Warren Campbell indicated that he and Chair Unger issued two Certificate of No Effect approvals since the last meeting. Both were for the Jordan Ranch property; one was to reconstruct and repair the large front picture window, and the new contractor may be the one also doing the other CNE, which was for reconstruction of the loading berth walls on the southeast corner of the packing shed. It is a very low wall, probably from zero up to 18 inches tall that was probably damaged over the years by cars driving over it. We don't believe work on either has begun, but we are trying to get those done within this year's budget while we have money available, so they need to be done by June 30th.

7. Discussion regarding the nomination and selection of a property to be awarded under the Historic Resources Recognition Award Program

Warren explained that the Commission has adopted the program and wanted to start discussing the

implementation the program. He then asked if the Commission wanted to nominate a property and indicated that we are still undecided as to if it is one or two a year, but we were trying to keep that number exclusive.

Note: Commissioner Gehlbach joined the meeting at 4:11 p.m.

The Chair noted that we have discussed what we want to do with this and had ideas regarding the potential properties. She then asked if the Commission wants to pick one or a couple and decide which one to do. Segner suggested discussing the program for the new Commissioner, so the Chair provided an overview of the purpose of the recognition program and explained that there are many properties that have historic significance; however, they don't qualify for landmarking, so we decided that there are some we would like to recognize. An example is the Cowboy Club, which was the site where they started the Cowboy Artists of America, and it was an historic landmark throughout the history of Sedona. The people that bought it a number of years ago altered it so much that it no longer looks like it should from the outside, but it does have the history. That was one that we thought should be recognized, and one of Steve's plaques talks about it.

Commissioner Segner indicated that the round house on the corner at Airport Road is a significant property, and Commissioner Fiene added that the Larson's own it. Commissioner Segner agreed and mentioned that the Larson's also own the brick buildings behind it to the right that were a motel at one time, and those are significant old buildings too.

Commissioner Fiene nominated Rainbow's End that is now Relics. Commissioner Segner stated that is going to be knocked down; however, Commissioner Fiene clarified not according to AI. Chair Unger added that building was brought to the Commission three or four times asking to be landmarked, but we had to tell them there was no way we could landmark it, because the front was significantly changed.

Commissioner Segner asked what the parameters are and if the parameters should be built first. Chair Unger noted that the parameters are pretty well set in the program. Warren recalled that the previous desire was to bestow this award on a willing recipient, so once we decide who might be number one and two, we might want to reach out and see if they are willing to have this bestowed upon them. We still need to figure out the details of what plaque-type of thing we will make. Commissioner Segner indicated that one of Larson's sons just joined the Historical Society, so now would be a good opportunity.

Chair Unger explained that she resists doing it for that building, because it is already pretty historic. They have not changed that; it could be a landmark. Commissioner Segner stated that they will never allow it; he and Janeen tried several times. Warren pointed out that part of the program is that a property that could be landmarked is not eligible. Commissioner Fiene stated that Kyle might do it. Commissioner Segner stated that they also own the property by the burial grounds, and they won't let us have access to it, because someday they might want to develop that area.

Chair Unger indicated that Relics would be on board in a heartbeat; she doesn't know about the Cowboy Club, because she hasn't talked to them. Commissioner Gehlbach suggested selecting a property that would draw people to Jordan and Uptown. Chair Unger pointed out that we will only be doing one or two a year. Warren stated that a deciding factor should be selecting a site that could play into another goal.

Commissioner Gehlbach stated that he was just thinking of the walking path. Commissioner Segner noted that he is getting lights put on that too, so it will be lit at night. Chair Unger indicated that the church might be eligible for historic designation. Warren Campbell asked which church, and Chair Unger stated that it is the Wayside Chapel. Commissioner Gehlbach then asked if it is possible to offer both historical designation and the new designation during the year. Chair Unger explained that if a property can be landmarked, we want to get it landmarked; this is only a recognition.

Commissioner Fiene asked what Wayside used to be, and the Chair stated that it has always been a chapel. Commissioner Segner pointed out that they have just remodeled the east side to put in the elevator. Donna Puckett explained that it was to accommodate pedestrians going to the City's parking lot, but she doesn't know if it is visible from the front.

Commissioner Segner then stated that we should pick one and get the plaque done, and then come up with a list. Commissioner Holmes stated that Rollie's would also be a good possibility, and Chair Unger indicated that it had been changed too much to landmark it. Commissioner Gehlbach indicated that if they have photos that could be an ideal one to start with.

Commissioner Gehlbach noted that we do have enough properties to consider, and Warren Campbell pointed out that the Art Barn doesn't meet the standard either. Chair Unger noted that they would love that. Commissioner Segner asked to back up and consider what we are trying to accomplish. We are trying to get people to understand the history in this town. When he put in the history walk, he just arbitrarily made a lot of plaques. What if we tied this into the plaques, so when we post a building we do a plaque on the history walk. You see it and it is just up the street, so Rollie's Camera would have a little thing on the wall, but the plaque would tell the whole story, so we would produce a big plaque with a small plaque.

Chair Unger referenced the budget and mentioned a possibility that maybe the City pays for the small plaque on the building, but the group you are working with pays for the other plaque. Commissioner Segner stated that he never worries about the budget; however, Warren pointed out that the thought was that we were keeping the recognition plaque under \$400, so we didn't feel it was something we had to take before Council, because for this year, we would be pulling it out of various HPC accounts, but if it reaches a certain level, we would need to go to Council.

Commissioner Segner indicated that Council would probably ask what the historic group did and indicate it would be nice to have a product, and then say that we are going to need a budget every year of X amount; here is how it works. He thinks they would like for the Commission to talk to them.

Warren explained that there were two items on this agenda, because these were Commission goals, and, at some point, he wants to be able to report what we have done and can report back that we have adopted the Recognition Program.

Commissioner Gehlbach commented that now the Chamber can create a new tour, so we have a historical tour that will generate additional revenues. Commissioner Segner stated that he has a plaque that has all of the movies made in Sedona, but we could come up with all of the historic buildings in Uptown and number them on the big plaques, and then people could go find them. This would be a wayfinding sign.

Warren Campbell indicated that is a great conceptual idea, but we should focus on who we are going to approach. Chair Unger indicated that we should look at Art Barn . . . Commissioner Segner interrupted to say the Art Barn, Rollie's Camera and the Cowboy Club. The Chair pointed out that we could probably only do two this year as she recalls the line item in the budget. Warren Campbell indicated that \$400 was kind of the total for the program. Commissioner Segner stated not to worry about the budget; do the right thing, and then we will worry about the money. Warren stated that we were looking at one or two and it depends on what we do with the plaque.

Commissioner Segner stated that by doing three or four, we will get some recognition from the newspapers and we can tie it in with the history walk. Chair Unger suggested instead of doing the metal ones, she worked with Commissioner Segner in the beginning. and they are constantly saying they are cheaper now and those will last a good deal of time. Commissioner Segner added that they have a 10-year warranty. The Chair then continued to suggest doing something like that instead of the really fancy ones, so it is different from the landmarks. If they get the same as the landmarks, maybe we shouldn't be doing that, and for \$400, she would think we could do two or three. Commissioner Segner stated that they cost about \$300 without designing fees.

Commissioner Segner questioned if they had to be on the building or if people would go find the building. Chair Unger indicated that people will want some recognition on the building. Commissioner Segner suggested telling them that we will mark it on the history walk, and they can buy a plaque for the building.

Commissioner Fiene asked how much they cost, and Commissioner Segner stated around \$380 plus he pays around \$200 for the stands. Chair Unger explained that she is talking about smaller plaques and we don't need the stands; she is thinking of putting them on the buildings.

Commissioner Segner asked about a picture of the building and Chair Unger said no, it can just be words. Commissioner Holmes referenced the ones in Flagstaff; they have a history walk with plaques on buildings that are very nicely done. She thinks they are stone.

The Chair indicated that we would have to talk to Rollie's. She knows the Art Barn would be ecstatic about it, but she doesn't know about the Cowboy Club. Maybe our first step is to talk to all of them, but she doesn't want to get their hopes up. Commissioner Holmes suggested starting with one and finding all of the weak spots, and then go for it.

Commissioner Fiene pointed out that we just talked about integrating these properties into the history walk, and it makes sense, but the ripple effect would be good if we could select those three to add to the whole concept of the history walk, then we could pull in the Chamber of Commerce to say you have never updated the material. They are using the original materials and making copies of it, and it is not as germane as a new brochure should be, so we could incorporate all of this stuff in it.

Chair Unger indicated that what we are discussing goes beyond historic preservation; it actually talks to tourism, so is there not some way to go to the City Council and say this is part of tourism rather than just historic preservation. Commissioner Segner stated that the 5% fund has \$3 million, and the point is we put money aside for projects, so he would just have to make a presentation to say that we need \$2,000 for this, and there wouldn't be a big problem. The Chair indicated that within the context of what we are discussing, we need to make a decision as to how we go about doing this, because she wants to stay within the budget, but also thinks we could think of it differently.

Commissioner Segner stated that would be the new Product Development Committee that looks for things that tie the City together with tourism, which the history walk does. It would be a logical thing to ask for. Chair Unger noted that Warren is looking in the context of historic preservation and our budget, but couldn't we think of it outside of that?

Warren indicated that there are always ways to ask certain questions; it is just the timing of that. The budget for next year is already in the pipeline, so he can't change that, but he would suggest that we reach out to whoever Commissioner Segner uses for those signs and ask what it would cost on a per sign basis for something more than 8 1/2"x11", maybe 12"x12" or 14"x14". Maybe some graphic designer knows that it is better not to have a perfect square. Then, do one of these and figure out what we want on there. Chair Unger noted that all of these buildings have changed and we have photographs of when they were new, so we could put the original photograph on there. Warren Campbell agreed.

Donna Puckett suggested checking the City's policy, because there have been times that if it is considered a City program, there are some concerns about seeking money from the community. Chair Unger stated that we would possibly go back to the Chamber of Commerce, because they have a budget that they have been given. Donna noted that the Chamber of Commerce is separate from the City, and we just need to be sure that we are not going against policy.

Warren noted that we are talking about two different ideas and two different sources of funding. One is funding for a small sign that would probably come out of the fund in the HPC budget. On another note, someone is going to be talking to the Chamber about using money they already get to fund that other plaque on the history walk. Chair Unger indicated that we then would not officially be going

after that as the Historic Preservation Commission, but Commissioner Segner could go to them and say this has been done by the Commission, so why don't we as a separate thing do this. Commissioner Fiene stated that it is easier than that, because they can update what they have already done; it is just too old.

Commissioner Holmes stated that another good place to look at markers with antique photos is in the Hyatt Point shops; they have a set of old-looking metal markers with words and pictures. Warren Campbell noted that Commissioner Fiene provided photos of a bunch of those for the PowerPoint.

Chair Unger stated that if we get that price for the next meeting, we can then talk to the Cowboy Club, Rollie's and the Art Barn. Warren Campbell asked about forming another staff working group; he can send out an email. He then asked Commissioner Segner if he goes to someone locally for the boards, and the Commissioner stated no, he gets them back east. He pays Mei Wei to do the design work, and then they ship it to them and after about ten approvals, they ship them back, but there is time setting it up and doing the artwork the first time. The format you do the first time is going to determine how you go down the line. We play with it and give it to a pro to clean it up, then the format will be used in all of the other pieces.

Commissioner Gehlbach asked if we collaborate with others could we also work off of their budget. Warren Campbell referenced what Donna said in that we would need to avoid blurring those lines. The Commissioner stated that we will get into that again when we get into the party, but another thought was working with the Historical Society. Warren indicated that would come under agenda item number 10. Chair Unger then asked Warren to send out the email and we will start there.

2. **NOMINATION AND ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR**

Chair Unger explained that we need to elect a Chair and a Vice Chair, and then she asked for nominations for Chair.

Nomination(s) for Chair:

Commissioner Holmes nominated Brynn Unger for Chair. Commissioner Fiene seconded the nomination.

No other nominations were presented.

VOTE: Nomination for Brynn Unger for Chair carried five (5) for, zero (0) opposed and one (1) abstention. Commissioner Pfaff was unexcused, and Brynn Unger abstained.

Chair Unger opened the nominations for Vice Chair and indicated that Commissioner Holmes has been there before. Commissioner Holmes stated that she has done her duty, and the Chair then stated either Kurt Gehlbach or Jack Fiene.

Nomination(s) for Vice Chair:

Chair Unger nominated Jack Fiene for Vice Chair. Commissioner Segner seconded the motion.

Commissioner Fiene nominated Commissioner Gehlbach; however, Commissioner Gehlbach declined the nomination.

VOTE: Nomination for Commissioner Fiene as Vice Chair carried five (5) for, zero (0) opposed and one (1) abstention. Commissioner Pfaff was unexcused and Commissioner Fiene abstained.

8. **Discussion regarding the goal of beginning the process to add an additional Landmark property**

Commissioner Gehlbach indicated that he spoke to the owners of the Stronghold property, and they

had questions about privacy, etc., and they were curious. It is a private road; Stronghold is in Oak Creek Cliffs; it is the Babbitt's property. Chair Unger agreed that it holds up to being a landmark and it is in the City limits., so that would be one the Commission could look at, and Kathy Levin had identified five possibilities and that was one of the most important ones, because of the history. Commissioner Segner stated that Mr. Babbitt could provide a lot of information, and Commissioner Gehlbach added that John is there the most and would like to live there now.

Warren Campbell asked if that is the one the Commission wants to go after. Commissioner Segner stated that they wouldn't have to worry about privacy, and Commissioner Gehlbach agreed. Chair Unger recalled speaking to one of the cousins, who was excited about it, and Commissioner Gehlbach stated that John was going to talk to his mother about it. Chair Unger then suggested that Commissioner Gehlbach follow-through on that, and Warren suggested that as Kurt has questions, he should contact Warren and Chair Unger. Commissioner Gehlbach stated that he would refer them to Warren; John had asked a few questions. Warren asked for him and the Chair to be kept in the loop and indicated that we could invite them in to meet with the three of them.

The Chair indicated that she has photos from when she was there, and Commissioner Gehlbach stated that John wants to work on it and get the apple trees back up. The Chair added that they have the little stone building by the river, and the story about coming here in the wintertime and one brother or her father taking off to return to Flagstaff and died in a snowstorm. It is really fascinating, and it has a lot to do with this area, so it would be a really good choice.

Vice Chair Fiene asked if Wayside Chapel would qualify. Chair Unger stated that the Commission would have to look at it again. She is surprised that it wasn't on the list. They first made a list of landmarks in 1997, but it may have been that they weren't looking at that many commercial buildings. Vice Chair Fiene suggested looking at it.

Commissioner Gehlbach stated that if we're going to create a flow of traffic; they are going to be crossing there between the Art Barn and the Church, so we need that bridge across there. Chair Unger noted that the bridge really doesn't fit into what we are talking about today, but it is something to think about. Warren stated that he will see if staff has ever done a survey on the Wayside Chapel.

9. Update/discussion on the Ranger Station Park Master Plan project

Warren stated that there are two structures, the home and the barn, on the site that are on the National Register and are local Landmarks. The property was landmarked in 1999 and was listed on the National Register in 2008. The City purchased it in 2014 and adopted the Park Master Plan in 2016. Since then, we have been moving forward, but he knows there has been frustration over how we are funding things, but he did prepare a list of what we have been doing. In 2017, we did quite a bit of stuff and it was the 100th anniversary of the home. We removed a bunch of sheds that were not historic, a newer house that Commissioner Holmes grew up in, reroofed the bar, installed Plexiglas on many of the windows, removed invasive tree species on the site and started grading the southern end of the site. In 2018, we have begun sewer and other utility installations, and they are running conduit for electrical. Chair Unger came to the site, because we are trying to determine if we can rebuild the porch on the house for less than \$5,000. We ripped up the carpet and underneath was plywood, under the plywood was (audio unclear) strips, and then more plywood, so there is no clear indication of how a previous deck was constructed. If we can move forward, we will bring that back for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Segner asked if there were any old pictures of the steps, and Warren indicated that we have lots of old pictures, but all you see is the fascia board of the deck. We have old pictures that show wooden steps and the stone steps showed up in the '40s or '50s. When you restore a building, you pick a period of time, so we are going to have to pick one, but we are looking at projects to spend the money we do have.

Warren showed some pictures of the buildings from last fall and pointed out the location for the sewer installation where the fence was. The trees back there are largely invasive trees and will be cut out for the utility line. Another tree has mistletoe and probably is not long for this world. He also showed a picture of the excavating being done in-house and explained that the alignment will be close to the location of the perimeter walking path, so we feel we can lay that crushed granite on top for a nice walking path. A lot of the backfill allowed us to lay down the materials for work in the wash for flood preparedness and also provided good clean backfill. After the wash project, we are not anticipating having to use that anymore for laydown, so they will be doing some rough grading on that southern end for when we are ready to do something, but it will be nice for some overflow parking.

Warren indicated that regarding some of the next steps, we talked about the grants, budgeting process and volunteer strategies, but we did submit a budget request for \$150,000 over the next two years to repair and restore the barn and the house, so he will figure out who you might want to speak with if you are interested in promoting this. Chair Unger expressed that it is great news and Warren added it is a pretty big step from where we were a year ago.

Commissioner Gehlbach indicated that the foundation of the house is stone and asked why they did not extend that out further for the front porch. Chair Unger stated that she didn't know why. Warren explained that there is stone underneath the porch. Commissioner Segner stated that you can do anything you want. A lot of times you want to make it look like it is not part of the house; he would just pour concrete steps and not try to go to a period. Warren explained that the steps are easier to figure out; it is what the surface is going to be. Commissioner Fiene stated that it will definitely not be tongue and groove. Warren then described the underside of the roof but asked if we reflect that on the ground. Commissioner Segner stated that you are then making the mistake of trying to put it back to what you think it was, when you should do something that looks different. Chair Unger explained that the hardest part is it is actually going to be within the confines of the frame that has been there forever, and this really isn't a discussion that we should be having now. Warren added that we will make the right decisions, because we are going to schedule it for a Certificate of Appropriateness, and Chair Unger agreed.

Commissioner Fiene stated that it is not unusual to see that type of ceiling for an overhang versus a plank of some sort on the bottom for drainage, so there can be a difference. The Chair stated that when it gets to that point it will come to the Commission, so she doesn't want to have that discussion until then. Commissioner Fiene added that by the same token, we don't want to limit our options either.

Commissioner Fiene then asked what happened to the cistern. Warren indicated that staff had it videoed and it looked like there were no problems. When we do a remodel; we have an old photo that shows the pipe system, so we have a greater idea of how it was being built. It is part of the reason that a tree growing out from under the foundation was removed.

10. Discussion regarding the planning for the celebration of National Historic Preservation Month in May

Commissioner Holmes stated that she met with Janeen Trevillyan who provided some fabulous ideas like arts & crafts, farmer's market, the Oak Creek apple lady and all sorts of attractions that we could use. Then, the Commissioner went to the site and realized that the Forest Service site is in just terrible condition; we shouldn't have an event on that site. The next best thing is we have our pop-up tent and we could join the Historic Museum on their 20th anniversary event, and we will have a fabulous display of the photos that Cynthia Lovely used last year, and we will talk more about what we can add – mostly just advertising the history of the Brewer Road site and the development of the park. We will reach more people doing that than any other thing she can think of, so we have pretty much decided that is what we are going to do. When she met with Janeen, the date was April 28th, but it is now being advertised as Saturday, May 19th from 10:30 to 3:00 p.m., and they are going to have Dutch oven biscuits and will probably have the Rice Brothers there with various other activities, so it is a fabulous opportunity to advertise our project. Warren will confirm dates with Janeen.

Chair Unger asked if we should also be talking about our new program for recognition, and Commissioner Holmes indicated that we could come up with a display for that, because Warren has some money that could cover that; however, Warren clarified that the HPC has some money budgeted for this event. Commissioner Holmes then added that Warren is also going to contact Janeen Trevillyan to see how we can contribute to their event or partner with them. Warren explained that he would check with Audree to see how we can best fund our involvement, so he will navigate the funding part and probably use some to get us a banner like 6'x2' to hang on a table or tent. The working group is thinking that would be an event, so we would invite the landmarked property owners to that event and not have a separate event. Commissioner Holmes noted that ideally it would be great to do it where we did last year, but we're not ideal right now, and Chair Unger agreed and suggested waiting for a year for that event, so we will do it at the Museum.

Commissioner Holmes then read the featured activities planned for the Museum's event. Commissioner Gehlbach stated that we could use our budgeted money, because we are partnering. Commissioner Holmes added that Commissioners could take shifts in the tent.

Commissioner Segner asked who the spokesperson is that represents the park at the budget conferences and asked how we garner support. Warren indicated that the Assistant City Manager has been quite involved, and it will be in the CIP in Public Works, and Cynthia will be there as well. Commissioner Gehlbach asked what the Commission is going to do that is special, and Commissioner Holmes repeated the plan for the tent, displays, etc. Chair Unger suggested also having something for the landmarks, and Commissioner Gehlbach then suggested a visual on a big screen hooked up to a computer.

Warren stated that he will find out how we can help and will let the working group know. Commissioner Gehlbach wanted to know if they would have food trucks, and the Chair and Warren indicated they didn't think so.

11. FUTURE MEETING DATES AND AGENDA ITEMS
Monday, April 9, 2018; 4:00 pm

The next meeting will be dependent upon getting the funds for the porch. Warren asked that the Commissioners pencil in April 9th, but he will let them know if it needs to change. The Chair added that Donna also will be letting us know more about what is going on with the conference too.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

If an Executive Session is necessary, it will be held in the Vultee Conference Room at 106 Roadrunner Drive. Upon a public majority vote of the members constituting a quorum, the Planning and Zoning Commission may hold an Executive Session that is not open to the public for the following purposes:

- a. **To consult with legal counsel for advice on matters listed on this agenda per A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3).**
- b. **Return to open session. Discussion/possible action on executive session items.**

No Executive Session was held.

12. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Unger called for adjournment at 5:12 p.m. without objection.

I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission held on March 12, 2018.

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Administrative Assistant*

Date