

**Action/Summary Minutes  
City of Sedona  
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting  
Vultee Conference Room, 102 Roadrunner Drive, Building 106, Sedona, Arizona  
Monday, May 10, 2021 – 4:00 p.m.**

*Note: As a result of an equipment malfunction, there is no recording of this meeting and the following minutes are taken from the Administrative Assistant's notes.*

**1. CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, & ROLL CALL**

Chair Unger called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m., led the Pledge of Allegiance and requested roll call.

**Roll Call:** Chair Brynn Burkee Unger, Vice Chair Jack Fiene and Commissioners Kurt Gehlbach, Allyson Holmes, Bob Huggins and Derek Pfaff. There is one vacancy.

**Staff Members Present:** Andy Dickey, Larry Farhat, Cynthia Lovely and Donna Puckett

**2. DISCUSS AND VOTE FOR CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR**

Chair Unger indicated that she would entertain nominations for Chair and Vice Chair.

**Nominations for Chair:**

Vice Chair Fiene asked Brynn Unger if she would be willing to be the Chair again, and she indicated yes. There were no additional nominations.

**MOTION:** *Commissioner Holmes moved that Brynn Unger be Chair. Commissioner Pfaff seconded the motion*

**VOTE:** *Motion carried six (6) for (Fiene, Gehlbach, Holmes, Huggins, Pfaff and Unger) and zero (0) opposed. There is one vacancy.*

**Nominations for Vice Chair:**

Chair Unger asked Jack Fiene if he was willing to be the Vice Chair again, and Jack Fiene indicated that he was going to have to decline the nomination. The Chair thanked Commissioner Fiene for his service as Vice Chair and confirmed that he was planning to remain on the Commission.

Chair Unger asked if anyone was willing to step up for Vice Chair and Commissioner Gehlbach stated that he would. There were no additional nominations.

**Commissioner Holmes moved that Kurt Gehlbach be Vice Chair. Commissioner Pfaff seconded the motion.**

**VOTE:** *Motion carried six (6) for (Fiene, Gehlbach, Holmes, Huggins, Pfaff and Unger) and zero (0) opposed. There is one vacancy.*

**3. ANNOUNCEMENTS & SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS BY COMMISSIONERS & STAFF**

Cynthia Lovely announced that Warren Campbell had left the City and moved back to Colorado, and she is taking his place as the liaison with the Commission. Karen Osburn is now the City Manager, and we are hiring for the Community Development Director position. Cari Meyer now is the Planning Manager, and she (Cynthia Lovely) is the Principal Planner. Kyle Storey has joined the staff and is working on residential development reviews, and we are hiring for an entry level position.

Chair Unger welcomed Cynthia and said that the Commission is grateful to have her as the liaison.

Chair Unger indicated that there was no conference again this year; however, Commissioner Fiene had a flyer indicated that the HP Conference would be held October 27<sup>th</sup> – 29<sup>th</sup> at the Old Fiesta Inn (DoubleTree) in Tempe.

Chair Unger then announced that the Tucson Historic Preservation Foundation was holding a virtual tour of six epic ranches northwest of Tucson on the 15<sup>th</sup> of this month, and you can get tickets on their website.

**4. APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING MINUTES:**

**a. February 10, 2020 (R)**

Chair Unger indicated that she would entertain a motion to approve the minutes.

***MOTION: Commissioner Holmes moved to accept the minutes. Vice Chair Gehlbach seconded the motion.***

***VOTE: Motion carried six (6) for (Fiene, Gehlbach, Holmes, Huggins, Pfaff and Unger) and zero (0) opposed. There is one vacancy.***

**5. PUBLIC FORUM: (This is the time for the public to comment on matters not listed on the agenda. The Commission may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Therefore, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H), action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date.)**

*The Chair opened the public forum at 4:11 p.m.*

**James Curry, Sedona, AZ:** Mr. Curry provided handout for the Commission and spoke in opposition to the proposed Jordan Lofts development at 630 Jordan Road by pointing out that it would be within 350 ft. of the Sedona Heritage Museum and create increased traffic and parking. It would not be in keeping with the historic character of the area and would set a perilous precedent if approved as others will want to do the same, and they have already approved one that has gone forward. It will permanently change Uptown, and even though it says short term rentals will not be allowed, it is likely that it will be used that way. It is a violation of the historic context of Uptown, in conflict with the City's traffic abatement plan, and of no benefit to the City's residents.

*The public forum was closed at 4:14 p.m. with no additional requests to speak.*

**6. REGULAR BUSINESS**

**a. Discussion of amendments to the Ranger Station Park Master Plan to accommodate a road connection between Los Abrigados and Brewer Rd. Presented by Stephen Craver, Engineering Supervisor, Public Works.**

Andy Dickey, Public Works Director showed an aerial photo of the area between 179 and Brewer Rd and explained that the goal of this and other SIM (Sedona In Motion) projects is to increase connectivity. When studying northbound and southbound traffic on SR 179 around the "Y" and Tlaquepaque, one of the biggest contributors is the U-turn traffic at the Schnebly Hill/179 roundabout that interrupts the northbound traffic flow. And, it is more of a contributor than the pedestrian traffic. If we can reduce the U-turn movements, the benefit is fairly significant. When going from Bell Rock Blvd. to the "Y", free-flow traffic is 15 minutes, and we can save two minutes by reducing the U-turn movements. Without a major bypass, we have to look at different minor improvements that together can make a big improvement.

There are three potential connections. One is the connection from Portal Lane through the Tlaquepaque parking lot. The other is coming off of the end of the parking area at the west end of the {Los Abrigados} development where we would punch through the wall with a one-way connection. The alignment was to keep it far to the south as shown, but it seems to make more sense to align it with the driveway to the park. Then, the third connection is the possibility of the City acquiring Prochnow Road from Los Abrigados, and they like the connection so it is one of our high priorities. With these connections, the pickleball courts would be removed, but that has been more of a priority at Posse Grounds Park.

Commissioner Holmes stated that she wants to minimize chopping up the place, and Andy explained that instead of two driveways you could only have one. The alignment is not finalized, but we pulled it further north to combine the driveways. Commissioner Holmes said that it should be as illustrated.

Chair Unger pointed out that the Commission didn't want pickleball, because it wasn't consistent with the park, and we will lose that either way. She also indicated that you don't want a big bend in that roadway the more the driveway is pulled down, plus you have to make sure that internal traffic flows efficiently.

Commissioner Holmes stated that it also goes across the walking path, and Andy explained that they would move it further north to miss it or cross it once. We have crossings in other locations and there are safety improvements that can be made. Commissioner Holmes indicated that we need to continue to build a walking path separated from the main park. There is a proposal to pull it further north, but it would cross it. Cynthia Lovely explained that you can go to the corner as shown on the plan and do some landscaping for screening, or it could be low landscaping to hide the road.

Chair Unger pointed out that either way it is going to cross the driveway. If it is further north, it will be longer. There is nothing you can do to stop people from having to cross it two times. Andy then showed how the two driveways could be brought together and cross in one spot, and he agreed that it would have more walking space in the corner. Cynthia added that it originally was intended to be a perimeter path.

Commissioner Holmes asked why we can't we use Prochnow now, and Andy explained that it is owned by Los Abrigados, but they are catching heavy fire from the residents.

Vice Chair Gehlbach added that it will be open to the public and Commissioner Fiene asked, when you bring the one-way into the park and connect it to the entrance of the parking area, how many people will drive the wrong way? Andy explained that there will be signage; however, the Commissioner then commented that you are dealing with tourists.

Commissioner Huggins asked what the traffic load will be on Brewer Road, and Andy explained that tourists aren't going to easily figure out that they can drive half-way around to get out, but it is essentially the U-Turn movement that we modeled. As far as the capacity of Brewer, it is not significant and probably the highest would be when Tlaquepaque has an event and the whole area is congested or when Los Abrigados lets everyone out all at once.

Vice Chair Gehlbach indicated that he couldn't imagine there would be a ton of traffic because of the speed bumps and going around the the fountain, etc. Commissioner Huggins stated that once locals learn it, they will go through there. Vice Chair Gehlbach stated that he is concerned about the foot traffic and the community garden, he would like to see the garden much bigger, and he then asked if someone will be employed to maintain them.

Cynthia Lovely explained that they were also proposing gardens at Posse Grounds, and there might be more space there. We wouldn't address those details until later. Commissioner Huggins indicated that Parks & Recreation will manage this and asked what their stance on this

is. Andy indicated that they were in favor of pickleball at Posse Grounds, and Cynthia explained that pickleball is a very social activity, and they preferred to consolidate it.

Chair Unger pointed out that the Commission should look at it in terms of what is affecting the visuals and the way it is historically. Figure out what is going to work in terms of the historic context. She is glad pickleball is going away, and it would be nice to have the walkway all around the outside edge. Commissioner Fiene agreed that pickleball doesn't belong with a 1917 historic house, and the Chair added that she is relieved that it is being removed. Traffic isn't our concern; it is to make something that feels like a park, but it would be best to have fewer crossovers. Vice Chair Gehlbach stated that it is funky to cross the path twice, and Commissioner Holmes said to leave it where it is, move the walking trail north, and go for Prochnow now.

Chair Unger explained that with the residents you can't do it quickly, and Andy explained that the residents say they have a right through minutes of a meeting with the county, and the minutes stated that Los Abridados was to use Prochnow for emergencies only, so there is some opinion that they can restrict their use of it. It is on their property, but it is like a blanket easement.

Commissioner Pfaff asked if the neighbors own part of the right-of-way, and Andy explained that they only have the right to use the easement. Commissioner Holmes noted that they used to drive through Prochnow anyway, and Andy stated that hasn't been done for a long time. We went through a couple of projects, then it became a huge issue and their Legal Department said not to use it for the time being. Chair Unger added that the City doesn't have the right to force them to use it.

Andy Dickey explained that the city ultimately wants all three connections, because that gives us the best chance of reducing that U-turn movement. Commissioner Holmes asked where that traffic would enter from, and Andy explained that we want both connections because only a certain amount of the parked vehicles will use that connection. Residents in the units will use it and locals, but the tourists probably won't. Chair Unger indicated that is not a tremendous amount of volume. They aren't going to advertise it as an exit; however, Andy added that when we know there is significant conflict, we might use it.

Chair Unger noted that you don't want two exits that close together, and Vice Chair Gehlbach suggested connecting it in the pickleball area as an exercise path, but the Chair pointed out that you would still have the crossing in two places. Andy explained that if you bypass the corner, you may only have one crossing. The idea is for the path to go along the road, so if we connect back to that, we would cross it at some point.

Chair Unger noted that you are opening up that area and would have a bigger space for something there. Commissioner Holmes expressed that her concern about the amount of traffic is if people will cross the traffic to access that space from the walking trail or if it will be inaccessible, because of the amount of traffic, from being on the walking path and then sitting under the trees, it changes the feel of the space. Chair Unger indicated that you could create a space in that corner to sit under the trees. She doesn't know that it gets that much traffic; you would see it more when a big event is happening.

Andy explained that if traffic is fine on SR 179, people aren't going to go out of their way. We're also not going to Brewer/Ranger, but the extra connections are important. It maybe would be 10 vehicles per hour for this little corner.

Commissioner Holmes asked where the punch through the wall is in terms of the rock home. Larry Farhat said that the Stone House is on the corner. Chair Unger suggested that the City should buy all the property around there and make it a bigger park, and Cynthia pointed out that it used to be all Forest Service property.

Commissioner Huggins stated that parks have an ambience like Jordan Historical Park, Posse Grounds has all the recreation, and Sunset is a quiet family park, and he has worked with the Ranger Park since the Heart of Sedona, and that property has a certain ambience of community events with family and friends stopping by, and he pictures it as a quiet place with activities. Visitors would be encouraged to walk, bike or use transit to reduce traffic and parking, and the parking was porous to absorb the runoff, but if it is not paved, it is a dust problem. It has been cut up so much, and the City is so fortunate to have it, but any impact bothers him -- anything that would impact it. The buildings are under appreciated; in 1933 the Forest Service used the bungalow style and almost all of them are gone now. It should be used as an interpretative area with the Heart of Sedona concept. Vice Chair Gehlbach agreed that we need more community and parks. We aren't community anymore; it is sad. Like the gardens that he wants to be larger.

Chair Unger indicated that Andy came with a design, but it won't exactly be like that, so she would like to see what you are saying if you move the road, so we can see how that area is going to be left and used and if there might be some place to sit there.

Andy stated again that they can keep the driveway close to the south end or combine it into one further north, and he explained that the item is scheduled to go to the Planning & Zoning Commission, so time is of the essence. Andy also explained the turning radius required to have a 90° turn, and Chair Unger pointed out that it wouldn't be paved, which is more in keeping with the way we want it to look. Vice Chair Gehlbach asked about the use of speed humps and Andy indicated they could be used, but cars will be going through a gate at the property line.

Andy asked if there is consensus to keep the two driveways separate. Our thought was to have one driveway instead of two, and Cynthia added that we have a citywide focus on having as few driveway cuts as possible. Commissioner Huggins stated that he wants the least amount of loss to the property as possible and the Chair noted that the way it is shown, there is more of a continuum of the park.

We could put some thought into what that space would be; our feedback has been benches, trees to sit under, etc. You could take the walk and remove the bottom corner and bring it to the upper side of the road, so the walkway can follow the road, and there isn't a break-up twice.

Commissioner Huggins asked if he could take this to Parks & Recreation to talk to them about it, and Andy indicated he could, but Andy would be happy to talk with them. Chair Unger indicated that the walkway would probably be of interest, and with the seniors, it would be good to have benches.

Commissioner Holmes stated her preference was to keep the route as shown. The Chair noted that the general consensus seemed to be to leave it as illustrated to keep it further south, but she is the odd man out on this one.

**b. Update/discussion on renovations to the Ranger Station house (250 Brewer Rd).**

Cynthia Lovely introduced Larry Farhat, Facilities Maintenance Manager, and Larry explained that he started in January of 2020 and quickly became involved with the Ranger Station. They have completed two sides of the residence -- the back of the house and the side facing Brewer Road, and the repair was better than expected; Loven Contracting is familiar with historic materials.

Larry showed a picture of the side facing Brewer Road that was done by Bill Ralston Construction and indicated that the three windows on the end had to be reproduced, the two in the middle and on the end are original. The windows are operable, and the siding was replaced; the majority of the siding is lap siding.

Larry indicated that they found some interesting carpentry in the walls, and the foundation is just bricks, but you can see the before and after. The colors are original, and we removed the modern utilities like the dryer vent and gas pipe and restored it to the way it would have been in 1923. Today, we have a fully executed contract to complete the rest of the house with Loven Construction by end of fiscal year 2021 or June 30<sup>th</sup>.

The current ramps are not compliant, but we are not touching it until we do the park itself. One of the other things that is a separate product is the Phase I electrical service. They didn't want the overhead power lines, so electricians are installing commercial service entry cabinets. It is a challenge, because it was a residence. Once we got with APS, they deemed that it had to be commercial, and we had to bring it up to Code. We should be calling for the building inspection on Wednesday, then APS will then pull power to the cabinet. Once the house is complete, we will get electrical; what is in the house is also not to Code. He is working on a bid for the exterior barn renovation in fiscal year 2022 and the interior of the house and barn in fiscal year 2023.

Cynthia added that they even checked with the Forest Service to ensure that they got the right color of green.

**c. Update/discussion of 2020 Certificate of No Effect approvals**

Cynthia reported that we did have one Certificate of No Effect and it was not needed on the second one. The one we did have was the Van Ness house on Zane Grey, and the new owners were interested in it being historic. She then showed pictures of a planter that they wanted to repair and the roof. She noted that in the past it wasn't as easy, but they didn't have to jump through as many hoops, and she had gone with Warren to see that the color and materials of the roof were complementary, and they had a couple of other landscaping suggestions, but it was a good meeting.

The other situation was a consultation on the Williamson House on Smith Road, and there is a patio with a pergola covering, so they listened to the owner's repair ideas, and the cost came into play, as well as if it was historically compatible, so she ended up repairing some of the slats and painted it, and it ended up being identical. The replacement materials would have been too much at the time. She wanted to take the wood pergola down and replace it with lattice, so we said that wouldn't work and not everything was gone, so she just replaced what was needed.

**7. FUTURE MEETING DATES AND AGENDA ITEMS**

**a. Monday, June 14, 2021; 4:00 pm**

Chair Unger indicated that we had discussed looking at other landmarks but asked if we should do a plan for the year. Cynthia stated that it would be good to have a meeting to discuss a work plan, and then asked if we should have it on June 14<sup>th</sup> or wait and the Chair suggested that the Commissioners send their availability to Cynthia.

Commissioner Huggins requested the Commission have an update on the Uptown CFA to look at things like the walking tour and possible wayside signs in the area. Cynthia asked that if the Commissioners have any photos that would explain their ideas, to please give her the information.

The Chair added that for two years we had planned on doing those plaques for those that couldn't be landmarked, so we might want to look at that too. Cynthia indicated that she believed Warren was getting ready to order a plaque for the Cowboy Club, but it wasn't ordered, so that might be the first thing, but she will check the file. Vice Chair Gehlbach asked if there were any others, and the Chair indicated no, because we were going to do one a year

**8. EXECUTIVE SESSION**

**a. If an Executive Session is necessary, it will be held in the Vultee Conference Room at 106 Roadrunner Drive. Upon a public majority vote of the members constituting a quorum, the**

Commission may hold an Executive Session that is not open to the public for the following purposes:

- b. To consult with legal counsel for advice on matters listed on this agenda per A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3).
- c. Return to open session. Discussion/possible action on executive session items.

*No Executive Session was held.*

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Unger requested a motion to adjourn.

***MOTION: Commissioner Holmes moved to adjourn. VKG seconded the motion.***

***VOTE: Motion carried six (6) for (Fiene, Gehlbach, Holmes, Huggins, Pfaff and Unger) and zero (0) opposed. There is one vacancy.***

The meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

*I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission held on May 10, 2021.*

---

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Administrative Assistant*

---

Date