

Action Minutes
City of Sedona
Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting
City Council Chambers, 102 Roadrunner Drive, Sedona, AZ
Tuesday, November 15, 2022 - 4:30 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, ROLL CALL

Chair Levin called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m., led the Pledge of Allegiance and requested roll call.

Planning & Zoning Commission Participants: Chair Kathy Levin, Vice Chair Charlotte Hosseini, and Commissioners George Braam, Peter Furman, Sarah Wiehl, and Lynn Zonakis. Commissioner Gajewski was excused.

Staff Participants: Kurt Christianson, Cynthia Lovely, Steve Mertes, Cari Meyer, Christopher Norlock, Donna Puckett and Hanako Ueda.

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS & SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS BY COMMISSIONERS & STAFF

Chair Levin announced that Vice Chair Hosseini, the Mayor and Vice Mayor interviewed for the three Commission vacancies and their recommendations to Council will be considered next Tuesday. She, Sarah Wiehl and Will Hirst will be recommended for appointment. Unfortunately, this also means that Commissioner Furman is leaving, and the Chair expressed her sincere gratitude for his service on the Commission and for his thoughtfulness and intelligence that he brought to his decision making, and she wished him well on the Council.

Commissioner Braam indicated he is going to miss one less “Fighting ILL-INI” on the Commission and wished him all the luck in the world. Vice Chair Hosseini indicated that she isn’t going to say bye; we’ll just see him in a different environment, and he is going to take all of his wisdom from P&Z and apply it at Council, so she feels good about that. Commissioner Zonakis thanked Commissioner Furman and said ditto from her; we will miss him but will see him in another capacity, and Commissioner Wiehl stated that she is super excited for him and can’t wait to see all he is going to do on the Council. She will miss him here, but she is super excited for what is next.

Commissioner Furman stated that in all the years he worked in the private sector, especially in his engineering companies, there was always a great saying that he loved whenever anyone was leaving the engineering group and going to project management, sales or marketing . . . or Council, it was always, “That’s great, because the average IQ of both groups has just risen”. He then expressed his gratitude for working with the Chair and all his fellow Commissioners present and past. This has been a very functional experience. Everybody on the Commission, all members current and past, work together as a team, think about the issues, read all the packet and all the letters; it has really been an amazing experience for him, and he has learned quite a bit and hopes that he will be able to apply many if not all of those lessons on City Council. He then thanked the Commission.

3. APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING MINUTES:

- a. October 18, 2022 (R)**
- b. October 18, 2022 (SV)**

Chair Levin asked if there were any corrections to the October 18, 2022, regular and site visit meeting minutes. If not, the minutes will be adopted.

No corrections were identified; minutes were approved.

4. **PUBLIC FORUM:** (This is the time for the public to comment on matters not listed on the agenda. The Commission may not discuss items that are not specifically identified on the agenda. Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H), action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date.)

Opened the public forum at 4:36 p.m. and, having no requests to speak, closed the public forum at 4:37 p.m.

Brought back to the Commission.

5. **Update/discussion regarding the Community Plan Update.**

Introduction by Chair Levin.

Update provided by Cynthia Lovely. Two virtual Zoom Listening and Learning Sessions will be held in December. The topic on December 7th from 5:00 p.m. to 7:30p.m. will be Circulation covering how Sedona in Motion projects will work together, and an invitation and update will be sent to everyone, including on social media and our email list. The public can ask questions and there will be virtual breakout rooms for more detailed discussions. The same format will be used on December 14th on Economic Vitality. In January, there will be one or two more virtual workshops followed by two in-person community forums that will be topic specific -- one on Tourism Management and the other on Land Use.

Commissioners' questions and comments of staff.

No action was taken.

6. **CONSIDERATION OF THE FOLLOWING ITEMS THROUGH PUBLIC HEARING PROCEDURES:**

- a. **Public hearing/discussion/possible action regarding a request for a Development Review for the construction of an approximately 20,000 square foot spa facility in four buildings and associated site improvements at 95 Sombart Lane. The property is zoned Commercial (CO), is approximately 5.35 acres and is located northeast of the intersection of State Route 179 and Canyon Dr. Case Number: PZ21-00009 (DEV) Applicant: Erwin Architecture (William Erwin)**

Introduction by Chair Levin

Presentation by Planning Manager Cari Meyer

Presentation by applicant's representatives: William Erwin with Erwin Architecture and Asset Manager for the Owners' Bill Muench

Commission's questions of staff and applicant's representatives

Chair Levin opened the public comment portion of the hearing at 6:20 p.m.

The following people spoke: Suzanne Gosar, Sedona, AZ; Megan Smith, Sedona, AZ, and Danielle Ondayko Lewis, Sedona, AZ

Closed the public comment period at 6:27 p.m. having no additional requests to speak.

Chair Levin recessed the meeting at 6:28 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 6:40 p.m.

Brought back to the Commission.

Commission's additional questions and comments for staff

MOTION: Commissioner Braam moved for approval of case number PZ21-00009 (DEV), Arabella Spa, based on compliance with all ordinance requirements of LDC Section 8.3 and 8.4 and satisfaction of the Development Review findings and applicable Land Development Code requirements as outlined in the staff report, which staff report is hereby adopted as the findings of the Planning and Zoning Commission, and the attached conditions of approval. Commissioner Wiehl seconded the motion.

VOTE: Motion denied three (3) opposed and three (3) in favor (Furman, Hosseini and Levin opposed and Braam, Wiehl and Zonakis in favor). Commissioner Gajewski was excused.

Statements by Commissioners who voted for denial:

Chair Levin stated that although the development land use is by right allowed, for her it is not right in terms of the 20-year mega drought that Arizona is experiencing, our promise to our residents to implement sustainable practices and to support the adopted Sedona Climate Plan. She thinks because it relies so much and its central thesis is to use water, to replenish water and to continue to use water that we should not be supporting proposals that are based on this kind of water usage. It goes against everything that the Council believes in, and she believes the community supports, in a healthy lifestyle here and in conserving our resources.

Commissioner Furman stated that adding onto that, he'll start by saying again he thinks it is a very beautiful project and he loved some of the things you did about low lot coverage and your responsiveness to the neighbors' concerns about vegetation and sight lines, the Zen quiet atmosphere, and your removal of the lodging, so you have done just many tremendous things here and he applaud you for that. He would've liked to have seen more good neighbor policies had you really defined the hours of operation and committed to no eventing, but really the justification for his no is although you complied with the LDC in many ways, he also thinks that he and this Commission look to our Community Plan where it talks about economic diversity, reduced traffic, environmental stewardship, vision and themes about stewardship, improved traffic flow and economic diversity, and he thinks that this project has missed about water use and the environmental stewardship. He is not sure that the parking analysis is really going to work out and it'll end up burdening the local area somehow with trailhead parking and this unknown ADOT traffic analysis yet, so he knows that we're allowed to and must think about balancing all of these things – the LDC with what the Community Plan says and the public benefit to him doesn't raise the level of the compromises that we're making relative to these other elements in the Community Plan.

Vice Chair Hosseini stated that she definitely couldn't have said it better. She agrees with everything the two of you had said, and when you talk about balancing, it just shows you we've got a split decision here. It is a matter of balancing and it's interesting that three to three means negative, a negative vote, but she really doesn't know what to say about moving the project forward. She doesn't even want to make suggestions in that way, because she thinks it's out of sync with where we are at this point, so anyway that is why she voted no.

7. FUTURE MEETING DATES AND AGENDA ITEMS
 - a. Tuesday, December 6, 2022
 - b. Tuesday, December 20, 2022

Cari stated that we don't have anything for either December meeting at this time. The noticing deadline is past for the first meeting, and she doubts that we will have anything for the second meeting.

8. EXECUTIVE SESSION

If an Executive Session is necessary, it will be held in the Vultee Conference Room at 106 Roadrunner Drive. Upon a public majority vote of the members constituting a quorum, the Planning and Zoning Commission may hold an Executive Session that is not open to the public for the following purposes:

- a. To consult with legal counsel for advice on matters listed on this agenda per A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3).**
- b. Return to open session. Discussion/possible action on executive session items.**

No Executive Session was held.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Levin indicated that ostensibly we might not get back together again until January, and if so, Happy Thanksgiving and Happy Holidays to everyone. She then adjourned the meeting at 7:01p.m. without objection.

I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the actions of the Planning & Zoning Commission in the meeting held on November 15, 2022.

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Administrative Assistant*

Date